

**AN ANALYSIS OF ECONOMIC AND INDUSTRIAL POLICIES OF
INDIGENOUS AND TRIBAL TOURISM IN TAIWAN**

HSIAO-MING CHANG

School of Physical Education, Putian University, China.

CHIN-LUNG CHOU

Department of Tourism Leisure and Health, Ching Kuo Institute of Management and Health, Taiwan R.O.C.

CHENG-LUNG WU*

Department of Marine Sports and Recreation, National Penghu University Taiwan R.O.C.

*Corresponding Author

ABSTRACT

The main purpose of this study is to analyze the impact of the indigenous peoples' policies of the ruling party on the development of tribal tourism in Taiwan during the different political parties' ruling periods, so as to provide a reference for researchers concerned about tourism policy planning. This study adopts qualitative research methods, through historical research, literature analysis, and interviews for data collection and analysis. After analysis, this study finds that: 1. Indigenous peoples' policies governed by different political parties mainly focus on the development of tribal economy and have consistency and seriousness. 2. Because the Taiwan Council of Indigenous Peoples in charge of indigenous people civil affairs does not have substantive rights, its main function is to provide consultation and subsidies for various ministries. 3. Due to the lack of professional human resources and assessment mechanisms for the implementation of the policy, most projects lack sustainable development after they are completed.

Keywords: Council of Indigenous Peoples (CIP), indigenous, tribal tourism, policy, change of ruling parties

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The indigenous peoples are one of the most important ethnic groups in Taiwan. There are 16 ethnic groups includes Ami, Atayal, Paiwan, Bunun, Puyuma, Rukai, Tsou, Saisiya, Yami, Thao, Kavalan, Taroko, Sakila, Sedek, La Aruwa, Kanakanafu. The population is about more than 530 thousand, and the population is more than 530 thousand. It has its own culture, language, customs and social structure. Over the past 400 years, Taiwan's indigenous peoples have been subjected to foreign nationalities and hegemonic domination, leaving them in a disadvantageous political, economic and cultural position. Faced with modern social changes and the invasion of global capitalism, most of the areas inhabited by the indigenous peoples are located in remote and economically underdeveloped areas. In addition, the traditional life of the tribes is not easy, and the employment difficulties result that the serious migration of the young and middle-aged population of the tribes, and the continuous loss of traditional

culture (Chang, Hung, & Chou, 2018). Moreover, due to the economic disadvantage of the indigenous peoples and the long-term stereotype of the Taiwanese people, the indigenous peoples are unable to obtain cultural recognition and support. As a result, the indigenous peoples are mostly engaged in labour work, with a high unemployment rate, high school dropout rate and high alcohol abuse rate. In 1996, Taiwan established the Council of Indigenous Peoples (CIP) which showed the change of the legal status of indigenous peoples in society. After the founding of the CIP, it was one of the important policies to promote the tribal economy and attract young people back to the tribe to start their own businesses. Because the indigenous tribes are located the region of rich natural environment, animal and plant ecological resources, together with indigenous peoples' rich in culture and knowledge, and the popularity of leisure and tourism in Taiwan, the development of tribal tourism has become the focus of policy implementation of the CIP. Since the CIP is the executive unit of indigenous peoples' policy, but few studies have been done to analyze the impact of CIP policies on the development of tribal tourism. Therefore, this study adopts literature analysis, historical research, long-term observation and field visits to the indigenous tribes for tourism development to understand that the CIP came from the implementation of the tribal economic development policy put forward by the leaders of political parties after its establishment. To explore the relationship and influence between indigenous peoples' policy and tribal tourism development, in order to provide a reference for researchers and planners of tourism policy.

2.0 PERIOD OF BEFORE CHANGE OF RULING PARTIES (1996-2000)

In Taiwan society after the lifting of martial law in 1987, indigenous social movements also emerged rapidly. Taiwan's earliest indigenous peoples' movement group, the Association for the Promotion of Indigenous Peoples' Rights, issued the Declaration on the Rights of Taiwan's Indigenous Peoples. Article 3 advocated that "the administrative body in charge of indigenous peoples' civil affairs should be at the central government-level". After many street protests by indigenous movement groups, it gradually emerged. To awaken the attention and reflection of Taiwan's society on indigenous peoples, and to rally the consensus of respecting multiculturalism, the ruling party should consider whether to set up a central government-level authority for indigenous peoples' affairs. Among them, the three "Return My Land Movement" in 1988, 1989 and 1993 had the greatest influence and the largest number of participants among all the indigenous social movements (Hsiao, 2018). Another was the "Right Name Movement" which pursued the subjectivity (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2016). Due to the influence of the indigenous social movement, on February 17, 1996, Mr Lian Zhan, former president of the Executive Yuan, instructed the establishment of a preparatory group for the indigenous peoples' committee. However, on February 29, 1996, Mr Chen Shuibian, then mayor of Taipei, took the lead in establishing the Indigenous Peoples Commission, Taipei City Government (IPCTCG). The main reason is that in the social background of Taiwan at that time, political parties began to compete and gave the indigenous peoples an invisible opportunity. Because the Kuomintang (KMT) did not do so, the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) took the lead in accepting the indigenous peoples' demands and established the IPCTCG. In this case, the ruling KMT also exerted invisible pressure. After many setbacks and consultations in the Legislative Yuan, the Organizational Regulations of the 《Council of Indigenous Peoples of the Executive Yuan》 were adopted on the third reading of November 1, 1996. On December 10, the Council of Indigenous Peoples was established in the Executive Yuan (renamed the Council of Indigenous Peoples in 2002).

In the organizational regulations of CIP, Item 4-6 of Article 7 stipulates that CIP shall be in charge of planning, coordination and counselling of the traditional skills, intellectual property rights and cultural industries of indigenous peoples; planning, coordination and counseling of indigenous farmers, forestry, fishing, animal husbandry, hunting and tourism; and planning, promotion and counseling of indigenous industry management and skills training. In terms of laws and regulations related to the development of tourism by tribes, on September 27, 1997, 《Guidelines of Subsidies for Promoting Industrial Activities of Indigenous Peoples》 was promulgated. Its main purpose is to promote industrial activities of indigenous peoples, enhance the efficiency of industrial management, enhance the industrial level and competitiveness, subsidize agricultural, forestry, fishing, animal husbandry, hunting, tourism and other industrial activities of indigenous peoples, and subsidize cultural property of indigenous peoples. Business activities, commissioning or organizing related indigenous industry seminars (study) activities, and other activities related to the indigenous industry (this point was abolished on November 5, 2011). From the above, because of the background of Taiwan's social development, the influence of indigenous social movement and the competition of political parties, the establishment of the CIP in charge of indigenous peoples was promoted in this period, which also made the Taiwan authorities pay more attention to the rights of indigenous peoples, and made the improvement of indigenous peoples' life as the main development policy.

3.0 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES POLICY AFTER THE FIRST CHANGE OF RULING PARTIES (2000-2008)

In 2000, the first change of ruling parties took place in Taiwan. Mr Chen Shui-bian, a DPP member, was elected President of Taiwan and succeeded in re-election in 2004. After taking office, Chen Shuibian advocated that the planning and implementation of indigenous peoples' land policy should be based on the combination of traditional knowledge and modern technology. To ensure that indigenous peoples in their own land can directly benefit from fair benefits and benefits of commercial activities, such as land afforestation and conservation, leisure and tourism, residential accommodation and so on. On November 18, 1999, CIP promulgated the 《Measures for the Preservation and Use of the Income and Expenditure of the Comprehensive Development Fund for Indigenous Peoples》. The purpose of this Law is to assist the social development of the indigenous people. The purpose of this Law is clearly stipulated in Article 5 for the use of economic loans for indigenous people (three loans for indigenous economic industry, youth entrepreneurship and micro-economic activities), and for the credit guarantee business for indigenous peoples (loans for indigenous economic industry, construction and purchase, etc.). Credit guarantees such as repairing housing loans, special loans for the reconstruction of indigenous houses in natural disasters, expenditures for promoting the development of indigenous or tribal cultures, expenditures for employment funds for indigenous peoples, expenditures for land development, resource utilization, ecological conservation, academic research and restrictions on the return or compensation of indigenous peoples' use of their lands and natural resources, and expenditures for indigenous peoples' employment funds. Planning, counselling and rewarding expenditure for the development, management and utilization of regional hot spring resources, and expenditure for promoting the development of indigenous or tribal cultures, etc.

In October 31, 2001, CIP proclaimed the 《Law on the Protection of the Right to Work of Indigenous Peoples》. Its main purpose is to promote the employment of indigenous peoples

and protect their right to work and economic life. The reason is that most of the indigenous peoples who work depend on their income. Therefore, it is necessary to prevent the impact of sudden environmental changes or sudden accidents and to curb the sudden rise of the unemployment of indigenous peoples. Article 15 of Chapter 5, Promoting Employment, is the most relevant provision for tribal tourism development. The Central Labor Authority shall provide indigenous peoples with opportunities to participate in various vocational training according to their employment needs, and during their vocational training, they shall be provided with a subsidy. Article 16 The central competent authority shall, in accordance with the cultural characteristics of the indigenous peoples, conduct various skills training and develop cultural industries in order to open up employment opportunities.

On February 5, 2005, CIP proclaimed the 《Basic Law on Indigenous Peoples》 which stipulates in Article 14 that the government should formulate economic policies for indigenous peoples in accordance with their wishes and characteristics of environmental resources, and guide the conservation and utilization of natural resources to develop their economic industries. In the part of the plan, CIP announces the implementation of the 《Industrial Development Plan of Indigenous Peoples and Tribes》 in January 2008. The implementation date is up to December 2008. The main purpose is to strengthen the indigenous peoples' industries, enhance the functions of production and marketing, create creative cultural industries, develop cultural tourism and increase employment opportunities. The focus is on the development of tribal traditional knowledge economy industry, cultural industry, eco-tourism industry, accommodation and catering industry, tourism industry, agricultural industry and processing industry, biotechnology industry, marketing of featured products, species classification planning, conservation and sustainable use of natural resources in the original ethnic areas, and in line with the overall development of the tribe, highlighting the benefits of the development of the tribal industry.

4.0 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES POLICY AFTER THE SECOND CHANGE OF RULING PARTIES (2008-2016)

In 2008, the second change of ruling parties took place in Taiwan. Mr Ma Ying-jeou, a member of the KMT, was elected President of Taiwan and successfully re-elected in 2012. Ma Yingjiu specifically advocates: counseling the development of tourism for indigenous peoples and the application of patents for related technologies of high-value species in the original countryside, and counseling the construction of a sound production and marketing system to develop the recreational tourism for indigenous peoples and the industry of "three lives" (production, life and ecology). In 2008, the CIP announced the 《First Stage of the Employment Promotion Program for Indigenous Peoples (2009-2012)》. The plan mentioned that the unemployment rate of indigenous peoples was generally higher than that of the general population, and the unemployment rate of men was 9.00% higher than that of women's 6.63%. In the plan, we should develop the economic industry in the indigenous people's areas, create long-term employment opportunities, develop hot springs and eco-tourism industries, restore the unique animals and plants in the indigenous peoples' areas, maintain the scenic trails and the ancient sacred mountain roads, develop local eco-tourism, and plan and build tribal hot springs, tourist attractions and tourist centers. Counseling them to manage B&B and hostility service with the characteristics of indigenous peoples' areas, designing and marketing package tour routes, and increasing local tourism income. In January 2010, the CIP announced the 《Economic Development Plan of the Indigenous

Peoples Industry in 2010》(Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2010). The second of the main objectives of the plan is to create a high-quality business environment and develop cultural and ecological tourism. Because the indigenous peoples' areas have unique human, natural ecology and biodiversity resources, which are the important basis for the development of ecotourism, under the principle of strict restriction of natural balance, the rivers, forests and wildlife around the tribe are valued and conserved, and the experience of cultural resources is innovative, which can cooperate with the key characteristics of the region, open up business opportunities and guide the indigenous peoples'. Indigenous people's traditional home care, flavour, food and herbal health care to attract tourists and activate the vitality and economic development of the tribal industry.

In the same year, the CIP also announced the 《Intermediate-Range Policy Address Plan of the Council Indigenous Peoples of the Executive Yuan (2009-2012)》. In the plan, the 《Mid-Range and Long-Range Plan for the Development of Indigenous Peoples Tourism and Three Production Industries for 4 years (98-101)》 was put forward. The plan points out that we should make good use of tribal characteristics and natural resources, promote eco-tourism industry with competitive advantages, values and innovative ideas, so as to create employment opportunities for tribes and enhance industrial competitiveness, thereby achieving the benefits of improving the economic conditions and quality of life of indigenous peoples. In order to develop the potential of tribal industry, cultivate the ability of industrial management and enhance the productivity and competitiveness of tribes, we should promote the development of three production industries (production, life and ecology) in indigenous peoples' areas with modern industrial economy and technology, cooperate with tribal industries with local characteristics, and carry out research and development and introduction of new technologies. In November 2010, the CIP announced the revised plan of the 《Three-year Plan for the Development of Indigenous Peoples' Economic Industry (2010-2012)》. The main objectives of the plan are to further cultivate native industries, to counsel tribal talents for employment, to enhance the productivity of indigenous peoples and to provide technical training and guidance, and to inspire the potential of indigenous youth.

Through various educational resources and entrepreneurial guidance mechanism, we can combine traditional craft skills and modern knowledge, and help indigenous traditional residential management, flavour food and health food, so as to attract tourists and activate the vitality and economic development of the tribal industry. The project will help to further cultivate the native industries, enhance their productivity and competitiveness, and improve the economic capacity and quality of life of the indigenous peoples. To revitalize the indigenous national industry and implement the long-term planning of local economic development, the development of the industry is oriented to cultural creativity, characteristic agriculture, ecological tourism and the development of characteristic tribal hot springs. The above plans start from three aspects: counselling indigenous tourism and three production industries, promoting indigenous cultural and creative industries, and building indigenous entrepreneurship and product development mechanism. In terms of guidance for the tourism industry of indigenous peoples, it's should take the development of festival tourism as the main axis, promote tribal eco-tourism, plan and recommend 25 tourism routes for indigenous tribes, guide the development and marketing of commodities in special industries, develop special catering, promote cultural experience products, travel, accommodation, leisure and

recreation business guidance. In addition, new tribal markets have been established and tribal hot springs with indigenous characteristics have been created.

In October 5, 2011, the CIP issued the 《Guidelines of Subsidies to Promote the Economic Industry of Indigenous Peoples》, the purpose is to promote the industrial activities of indigenous peoples, whose subsidies are to develop or innovate the tourism, life, production, ecology and economic activities of indigenous peoples, and to promote the activities related to the tourism industry of indigenous peoples. In order to improve the facilities of indigenous peoples' areas, we should cooperate with the activities of cultural experience, eco-tourism, food and beverage, and agricultural products held by tribal rituals at the age of the indigenous peoples' areas. Improve the tourism facilities of indigenous tribes, subsidize and guide the development, packaging design, production facilities, production machinery, transportation and marketing facilities, transportation and marketing materials, gathering and processing facilities and other agricultural production and marketing facilities of competitive agricultural products in indigenous peoples' areas. In 2013, the CIP announced the 《Creative Economy Plan to Promote the Knowledge Development of Indigenous Peoples》 (implemented in November 2013 and ended in December 2016). Its main purpose is to encourage indigenous peoples to use traditional experience and wisdom as the basis for the development of indigenous peoples' industries, to construct an economic basis for finding a cultural heritage for tribes, and to achieve the mission of cultural heritage and environmental sustainability in economic activities. For the purpose of promoting the development of indigenous peoples' industries, we should select the demonstration areas for the development of indigenous peoples' industries. The scope of the project is to promote the cultural and creative industries, characteristic agriculture, and eco-tourism industries.

In March 2014, in order to actively assist in the development of natural and cultural tourism resources in all indigenous peoples areas, the CIP formulated the 《Road Improvement Plan for Indigenous Peoples Tribes for 2014-2017》. According to the industry, resources and characteristics of the indigenous tribes, 60 private housing tourism routes of the tribes have been developed in the current 《Three-year Plan for the Development of the Economy and Industry of the Aboriginal Nationalities (2010-2012)》 of the CIP, and the future 《Four-year Plan for the Development of the Economic Industry of the Indigenous Peoples (2013-2016)》, aiming at the rich humanities and nature of the surrounding areas. Landscape and: 1. Deep tourism conditions need to attract tourists or consumers to enter or 2. Tribes without deep tourism conditions need access to external marketing to provide assistance in hardware construction. In order to link the resources and characteristics of related tribes and promote the local industrial economy. In addition, the tribal tourism projects promoted by the CIP since 2014 include the 《Tribal Heart Travel-Deep Travel Train Project for Indigenous Peoples Tribes》 (in cooperation with Taiwan Railway Administration) in which tourists experience and share tribal life, which is different from the general mode of tourism. The purpose of this project is to lead tourists to a profound, slow-walking, small-crowding and life-sharing journey with tribal people. Experience the harmonious relationship between indigenous peoples and nature, the performance of arts and crafts and the achievements of tribal industry development. In order to enhance the visibility of indigenous tribes and increase the number of tourists, the CIP selected 17 tribal tourism routes to promote the deep travel of indigenous tribes in 2014.

The 《Tribal Water Resources Planning and Water Supply Phase III (2010-2015) Plan for Indigenous Peoples Areas (2nd Revision)》 (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2015) announced in October 2014 points out that in recent years, tourism and leisure industries have been developed in indigenous peoples areas. Domestic and industrial water users have a competing effect, aggravating water shortage, and uneven distribution of front-end water sources, resulting in the lack of water for back-end users. It is difficult to find another source of water, and the funds are huge. Therefore, it is a problem for the indigenous peoples' areas to improve the water resources by cooperating with the top companies. On October 19, 2015, Taiwan Executive Yuan approved the revision plan of the 《Four-Year Plan for the Development of Indigenous Peoples Economy and Industry (2014-2017)》. The main objectives of the plan are as follows: 1. Developing a creative economy based on regional and ethnic cultural characteristics, combining with indigenous knowledge, and creating a bright spot for national industry demonstration. 2. Develop the commodities and services for Chinese people to experience the indigenous culture, promote the renovation of traditional industries, create tribal output value, and enhance the economic benefits of indigenous peoples. 3. Create new micro-cooperative industries of tribal type, build industrial operation and marketing platforms, and create local employment opportunities. 4. To cultivate young and middle-aged business and marketing management talents of indigenous peoples, promote the soft power of national industry and create a platform for young people to return home to work with regional industry impetus.

5.0 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES POLICY AFTER THE THIRD CHANGE OF RULING PARTIES (2016-2020)

In 2016, the third change of ruling parties took turns, and the Ms Tsai Yingwen of the DPP was elected president. Her indigenous peoples policy specifically advocates strengthening the support network of urban indigenous peoples and the original countryside to create their fair development opportunities; creating sustainable economic development of indigenous peoples, protecting traditional knowledge of indigenous peoples and cultural-based economic opportunities and activities, rewarding tribes to establish cultural and economic autonomy through internal governance mechanisms, and developing local cultural creation and ecological tourism and other industrial models. To restore the economy of sharing and mutual aid among tribes, and to adopt financial policies to help develop the industries and undertakings of indigenous peoples. Activate the Comprehensive Development Fund for Indigenous Peoples, construct financing loans and micro-insurance mechanisms that meet the needs of indigenous peoples, enhance the social capital of urban indigenous peoples, establish industrial links between urban and rural areas, promote employment opportunities and assist economic development.

In terms of the policy of tribal tourism development, although Taiwan's change of ruling parties in May 2016, the original planned indigenous peoples' policy did not change much. In the same year, the Taiwan Executive Yuan approved that in August 2016, the CIP put forward the 《Third Phase (2017-2020) of the Program for Promoting Indigenous Peoples Employment》 (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2017). The second development goal of the program is to develop the economic industry in the indigenous peoples' areas and create long-term employment opportunities. Among the contents, two are related to tourism. 1. Developing eco-tourism industry: maintaining landscape trails and developing eco-and agricultural tourism in indigenous peoples' areas; planning and constructing tribes, tourist

spots, national parks and scenic spots tourist centers, counseling indigenous peoples to provide accommodation, catering, accompanying rituals and life experience services with the characteristics of indigenous peoples areas; and marketing package tourism routes to increase tourism and leisure income in the original areas. 2. Developing cultural, technical and characteristic industries: handling indigenous peoples economic and industrial loans, micro-economic loans for youth entrepreneurship loans (production-oriented); counseling local characteristic industries, creating cultural output value, setting up tribal cultural studios, producing handicraft products with indigenous peoples characteristics; counseling indigenous peoples to participate directly in the conservation and management of water conservancy public construction; Aboriginal Cultural Relics Museum and national music and dance theatre exhibitions and other projects to develop economic industries in indigenous peoples areas.

In August 2017, the CIP announced the 《Four-year Plan for the Development of Indigenous Peoples Economic Industries (2018-2022)》, which is currently under implementation. The objectives of the plan are as follows: 1. To construct or deepen the highlights of industrial demonstration with the characteristics of indigenous cultures, and to strengthen the integration of technology and resources across industries, so as to create an environment for sustainable operation. 2. Excavate and cultivate indigenous peoples' industry management talents, and strengthen the cooperation between industry and university to fill the gap of industry talents with the strategy of "learning by doing" and "learning by doing". 3. Moulding and promotion of indigenous peoples' industry brand, and through story marketing and quality optimization, to ensure the uniqueness and representativeness of the brand. 4. Strengthen investment and counselling strategies for indigenous peoples' new ventures, and seek appropriate business models in order to stabilize the foundation of entrepreneurship and deepen the industrial foundation. 5. Strengthen the industrial chain between the metropolis and the original countryside, and use the former store (metropolis) and the latter factory (original countryside) model to make up for the shortcomings, so as to smooth the flow of products and services of indigenous peoples. 6. Implement gender statistical analysis, strengthen indigenous women's decision-making opportunities to participate in economic and industrial development policies, and build a gender-friendly environment. Since the term of office of Tsai Yingwen will end on May 20, 2020, it is impossible to explain the impact of the whole ruling on tribes. In fact, from the perspective of policy and planning, the tribal tourism development policy of the CIP has not changed much. It is a continuing medium-term and long-term development plan.

6.0 CONCLUSION

From the perspective of the policy development of the CIP, in fact, three political party rotations, although each leader's views are different, but there is not much difference in the formulation of the indigenous peoples' policy, and even the plan for many years is continuous. Because the goals of the two political parties in Taiwan are unchanged for the development of tribal economy, the promotion of employment opportunities for indigenous peoples and the improvement of their lives. The leaders of various political parties and the Executive Yuan are all trying to help the indigenous peoples to solve the problem of land. For example, the president apologized publicly to the indigenous peoples in August 1, 2016, on the Indigenous Peoples Day, but it was also a problem of land that could not be solved. Therefore, it was still necessary to follow the way of the former administration to solve the

problem of employment and employment of the indigenous peoples. The indigenous peoples emphasize the issue of "land" and "autonomous region", but in fact, political parties are unable to change. The main reason is that the land area of Taiwan is not as vast as that of Canada, the United States and Australia (Shih, 2019). Many places are uninhabited and can be used as autonomous areas for indigenous peoples. Therefore, indigenous peoples emphasize the issue of land. In fact, political parties are unable to solve the problem, which also results in a great gap in the expectations of indigenous peoples for political parties. Moreover, since the founding of the CIP, the policies and plans have been continuous, and have not changed because of the change of ruling parties. The main purpose is to utilize the natural environment and geographical advantages of the indigenous tribes, together with the cultural and inherited knowledge of the indigenous tribes, to develop the tribal culture and ecological tourism, and to guide the indigenous peoples to manage B&B and developing hot springs industry. However, in contrast, during the reign of former President Ma Yingjiu, policies and plans had more impact on the positive development of tribal tourism because of the dynamic development of tourism. According to the above explanation, the following conclusions are drawn in this study:

(1) After three times change of ruling parties in Taiwan, the indigenous peoples of different political parties are mainly to develop the economy of the tribes, and to use the traditional cultural knowledge of the indigenous peoples and the natural ecological environment of the tribes to develop tourism, so as to improve the economic situation of the tribes and attract young people to return home.

(2) Throughout Taiwan's previous presidents' indigenous policy propositions, they all attach importance to the rights of indigenous peoples and hope to develop tourism to activate the economy of tribes. However, after three times the change of ruling parties, the most desired land and autonomous areas for indigenous peoples still exist. Just like the Tsai Yingwen's apology for indigenous peoples, although some of the indigenous peoples are touched, in her term of office, to reach his campaign promise, in fact, the indigenous peoples have a lot of questions in their minds.

(3) Despite the continuity of the economic development policies of the indigenous tribes and the continuous proposals for tribal tourism, the results and effects are not high. The main reason is that the CIP is not a government department with real power. In addition, due to the lack of human and financial resources, all plans must rely on other government agencies to promote them. Therefore, the promotion of the plan is ineffective. It has become that every year a budget is needed to subsidize tribal tourism development activities, so there is a lack of sustainable development.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This study was supported by a grant from the National Social Science Foundation of China (No.18BMZ130).

REFERENCE

Chang, Hsiao-Ming., Hung, Chiu-Hui., & Chou, Chin-Lung (2018). A Study of Alishan Indigenous Tribal Tourism Development in Taiwan. *Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology*, 8(1), 1-12.

Council of Indigenous Peoples (2010). *Economic Development Plan of the Indigenous Peoples Industry in 2010*. Taiwan, Taipei: Council of Indigenous Peoples. (Chinese version)

Council of Indigenous Peoples (2015). *Tribal Water Resources Planning and Water Supply Phase III (2010-2015) Plan for Indigenous Peoples Areas (2nd Revision)*. Taiwan, Taipei: Council of Indigenous Peoples. (Chinese version)

Council of Indigenous Peoples (2016). Origin and significance of "Indigenous Peoples Day" on August 1. Taiwan, Taipei: Council of Indigenous Peoples. (Chinese version)

Council of Indigenous Peoples (2017). *Third Phase (2017-2020) of the Program for Promoting Indigenous Peoples Employment*. Taiwan, Taipei: Council of Indigenous Peoples. (Chinese version)

Hsiao, Shih-Hui. (2018). From land claim to forest protection: Anti-Asia Cement Corporation movement inspires the indigenous movement. *Journal of the Taiwan Indigenous Studies Association*, 8(1), 105-26. (Chinese version)

Shih, Cheng-Feng. (2019). Aboriginal Land Rights in Australia. *Journal of the Taiwan Indigenous Studies Association*, 9(1), 1-45. (Chinese version)